

21 Centuries of Catholic Doctrine: THE HOLY TRINITY

As taught in the Church's historical writings, from the time of the Apostles down to today

circa 70 destruction of the Temple in Jerusalem

ca. 70 *Didache or The Teaching of the Twelve Apostles*

—divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

7:1 In regard to Baptism—baptize thus: After the foregoing instructions, baptize in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit (Mt 28:19) in living water.

ca. 96 *Pope Saint Clement I, fourth Bishop of Rome, disciple of the Apostles Peter and Paul, Letter to the Corinthians*

—one God, not many | (divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit)—

46:6 Do we not have one God, one Christ, and one Spirit of Grace poured out upon us? And is there not one calling in Christ (Eph 4:4-6)? ...

58:2 For as God lives, and as the Lord Jesus Christ lives, and the Holy Spirit, and the faith and hope of the elect, as surely will he that humbly and with equanimity and without regret carries out the commandments and precepts given by God, be enrolled and chosen among the number of those who are being saved through Jesus Christ, through whom there is glory to Him forever and ever. Amen.

ca. 100 death of John, last of the Apostles

ca. 107 *Saint Ignatius, Bishop of Antioch, disciple of the Apostle John, Letter to the Ephesians*

—one God, not many | (divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit)—

9:1 You are like stones for a temple of the Father, prepared for the edifice of God the Father, hoisted to the heights by the crane of Jesus Christ, which is the cross, using for a rope the Holy Spirit.

ca. 107 *Ignatius of Antioch, Letter to the Romans*

—divinity of Christ—

Greeting To those who are united in flesh and

in spirit by every commandment of His, who are filled with the grace of God without wavering, and who are filtered clear of every foreign stain, I wish an unalloyed joy in Jesus Christ, our God.

ca. 125 *Aristides of Athens, Apology*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

15 [Christians] acknowledge God, the Creator and Maker of all things, in the only-begotten Son and in the Holy Spirit. Other than Him, no god do they worship.

ca. 144 *Pope Saint Pius I defends inspiration of books of the Bible against Marcion*

ca. 150 *Hermas, brother of Pope Saint Pius I, The Shepherd*

—one God, not many—

Mandates 1:1 Believe first of all that God is one, that He created all things and set them in order, and brought out of non-existence into existence everything that is, and that he contains all things while He Himself is uncontained.

ca. 150 *Saint Justin the Martyr, First Apology*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

13 We will prove that we worship Him reasonably; for we have learned that He is the Son of the true God Himself, that He holds a second place, and the Spirit of prophecy a third. For this they accuse us of madness, saying that we attribute to a crucified man a place second to the unchangeable and eternal God, the Creator of all things: but they are ignorant of the mystery which lies therein. ...

61 [Those who are to be baptized] are led by us to a place where there is water; and there they are reborn in the same kind of rebirth in which we ourselves were reborn: in the name of God, the Lord and Father of all, and of our Savior,

Jesus Christ, and of the Holy Spirit (Mt 28:19) they receive the washing with water. ...

63 They who assert that the Son is the Father are proved to know neither the Son or the Father, or that the Father of all has a Son, who is both the first-born Word of God and is God.

...

65 Then there is brought to the president of the brethren bread and a cup of water and of watered wine; and taking them, he gives praise and glory to the Father of all, through the name of the Son and of the Holy Spirit.

ca. 156 *martyrdom of Saint Polycarp, last of the Apostolic Fathers*

ca. 156 **The Martyrdom of Saint Polycarp**

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

14:3 [Polycarp looked up to heaven and prayed:] “In this way and for all things do I praise you, I do bless you, I do glorify you through the eternal and heavenly High Priest, Jesus Christ, your beloved Child; through whom be glory to you with Him and with the Holy Spirit, both now and through ages yet to come. Amen.”

ca. 170 **Tatian the Syrian, student of Saint Justin the Martyr, Address to the Greeks**

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

The heavenly Word, who is Spirit begotten by the Father, and Word from the rational potency, made man an image of immortality in imitation of the Father who begot Him. In that way, as incorruption pertains to God, so man, sharing in the portion of God, might have immortality too. Indeed, the Word, before ever men were made, was the Creator of the angels.

ca. 177 **Athenagoras of Athens, Supplication for the Christians**

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

10 The Son of God is the Word of the Father, in thought and actuality. By him and through him all things were made, the Father and the Son being one. Since the Son is in the Father and the Father is in the Son by the unity and power of the Spirit, the Mind and Word of the Father is the Son of God.

And if, in your exceedingly great wisdom, it occurs to you to inquire what is meant by “the Son,” I will tell you briefly: He is the first-begotten of the Father, not as having been produced,—for from the beginning God had

the Word in Himself, God being eternal mind and eternally rational,—but as coming forth to be the model and energizing force of all material things ...

24 Just as we assert that there is a God, and a Son who is His Word, and a Holy Spirit, united in power—the Father, the Son, and the Spirit, the Son being the Mind, Word, and Wisdom of the Father, and the Spirit an effluence like light from fire.

ca. 181 **Saint Theophilus, Bishop of Antioch, To Autolycus**

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

2:3 It is the attribute of God—of the Most High and Almighty and of the living God—not only to be everywhere, but also to hear all and to see all; for He can in no way be contained in a place. If He were, the place containing Him would be greater than He is; for that which contains is greater than that which is contained. God is not contained, but is Himself the place of everything. ...

2:10 God, therefore, having His own Word internally in His very organs, begot Him, emitting Him along with His own Wisdom, before all things. He had this Word for a Helper in the things which He made, and through Him were all things created. He is called Beginning, because He rules and has dominion over everything which was fashioned by Him.

He then, being Spirit of God and Beginning and Wisdom and Power of the Most High descended upon the prophets and through them spoke of the creation of the world and of all the rest; for the prophets did not exist when the world came to be, but there was Wisdom, which was in Him and which was of God, and His Holy Word, who is eternally present to Him.

...

— first recorded use of “Trinity”—

2:15 The three days before the luminaries were created are types of the Trinity: God, his Word, and his Wisdom.

ca. 185 **Saint Irenaeus, Bishop of Lyons, student of Polycarp, Against Heresies**

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

1:10:1 For the Church, although dispersed throughout the whole world even to the ends of the earth, has received from the Apostles and from their disciples the faith in one God, the Father Almighty, the Creator of heaven and earth ... and in one Jesus Christ, the Son of

God, who became flesh for our salvation; and in the Holy Spirit, who announced through the prophets the dispensations and the comings, and the birth from a Virgin, and the passion, and the resurrection from the dead, and the bodily ascension into heaven of the beloved Christ Jesus our Lord, and His coming from heaven in the glory of the Father to re-establish all things (Eph 1:10); and the raising up again of all flesh of all humanity, in order that to Jesus Christ our Lord and God and Savior and King, in accord with the approval of the invisible Father, every knee shall bend of those in heaven and on earth and under the earth, and that every tongue shall confess Him (Phil 2:10-11)

3:19:2 Nevertheless, what cannot be said of anyone else who ever lived, that [Christ] is Himself in His own right God and Lord and Eternal King and Only-begotten and Incarnate Word, proclaimed as such by all the Prophets and by the Apostles and by the Spirit Himself, may be seen by all who have attained to even a small portion of the truth. The Scriptures would not have borne witness to these things concerning Him, if, like everyone else, He were mere man. But that He had in Himself what no other ever had, that pre-eminent generation by the Most High Father; and that he also experienced that pre-eminent birth from a Virgin,—the divine Scriptures testify to both in His regard.

4:20:1 It was not angels, therefore, who made us nor who formed us, neither did angels have the power to make an image of God. It was not some power existing far from the Father of the universe, nor was it anyone else, other than the Word of the Lord. God had no need of others to make what He had already determined of Himself to make, as if He had not His own hands. For with Him always are the Word and the Wisdom, the Son and the Spirit, through whom and in whom He made all things freely and spontaneously; and to whom He spoke, saying: “Let us make man in our image and likeness” (Gn 1:26). . . .

5:18:2 And thus it is shown that there is one God the Father, who is above all and through all and in all. The Father indeed is above all, and He is the Head of Christ. But the Word is through all, and He is the Head of the Church. The Spirit, however, is in us all, and He is the Living Water (Jn 7:38-39) which the Lord grants to those who rightly believe in Him and love Him and who know that there is one Father,

who is above all and through all and in us all (Eph 4:6).

ca. 200 Saint Clement of Alexandria, *The Instructor of the Children*

—*one God, not many* / *divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit*—

1:6:41:3 When the loving and benevolent Father had rained down the Word, that Word then became the spiritual nourishment of those who have good sense. O mystic wonder! The Father of all is indeed one, one also is the universal Word, and the Holy Spirit is one and the same everywhere; and one is the Virgin Mother. I love to call her the Church.

ca. 200 Tertullian, *The Demurrer Against the Heretics*

—*one God, not many* / *divinity of Christ / filioque*—

13:2 There is one only God, and none other besides Him, the Creator of the world who brought forth all things out of nothing through His Word, first of all sent forth. . . .

13:4 Thenceforth [Jesus Christ] preached a new law and a new promise of the kingdom of heaven; worked miracles; was crucified, rose again on the third day; and having ascended into heaven, sat at the right of the Father; 5 sent the Holy Spirit with vicarious power to lead those who believe.

ca. 211 Tertullian falls into the Montanist heresy

ca. 215 Tertullian, *Against Praxeas*

—*one God, not many* / *divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit*—

2:1 We do indeed believe that there is only one God, but we believe that under this dispensation, or, as we say, *οἰκονομία*, there is also a Son of this one only God, His Word, who proceeded from Him and through whom all things were made and without whom nothing was made (Jn 1:3). . . . We believe He was sent down by the Father, in accord with His own promise, the Holy Spirit, the Paraclete, the Sanctifier of the faith of those who believe in the Father and the Son, and in the Holy Spirit.

. . .

2:4 And at the same time the mystery of the *οἰκονομία* is safeguarded, for the Unity is distributed in a Trinity. Placed in order, the Three are the Father, Son, and Spirit. They are Three, however, not in condition, but in degree; not in substance, but in form; not in power; but in kind; of one substance, however, and one condition and one power, because He is one God of whom degrees and forms and

kinds are taken into account in the name of the Father, and of the Son, and of the Holy Spirit.

...

—*filioque*—

4:1 I believe that the Spirit proceeds not otherwise than from the Father through the Son. ...

9:1 Keep always in mind the rule of faith which I profess and by which I bear witness that the Father and the Son and the Spirit are inseparable from each other, and then you will understand what is meant by it. Observe, now, that I say the Father is other, the Son is other, and the Spirit is other. This statement is wrongly understood by every uneducated or perversely disposed individual, as if it meant diversity and implied by that diversity a separation of Father, Son, and Holy Spirit. ...

25:1 Thus the connection of the Father in the Son, and of the Son in the Paraclete, produces three who, though coherent, are distinct one from another. These Three are one, and yet not one: for "I and the Father are One" (Jn 10:30) was said in regard to their unity of substance, but not in regard to a singularity of number.

ca. 215 Saint Hippolytus of Rome, Bishop of Pontus, student of Irenaeus, *The Apostolic Tradition*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit*—

4 [The newly ordained bishop shall say:] "We give you thanks, O God, through your beloved Son Jesus Christ, whom in these last days you have sent to us as Savior and Redeemer and as the angel of your will; He that is your inseparable Word, through whom you made all things, and who is well-pleasing to you; whom you sent from heaven into the womb of a Virgin, and who, dwelling within her, was made flesh and was manifested as your Son, born of the Holy Spirit and of the Virgin ...

"Gather as one in the fullness of the Holy Spirit your saints who participate; and confirm their faith in truth so that we may praise and glorify you through your Son Jesus Christ, through whom be glory and honor to you, to the Father and the Son with the Holy Spirit, in your holy Church, both now and through the ages of ages. Amen."

ca. 225 Origen, student of Clement of Alexandria, *The Fundamental Doctrines*
—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit*—

4:4:1 For we do not hold that which the

heretics imagine: that some part of the substance of God was converted into the Son, or that the Son was procreated by the Father from non-existent substances, that is, from a substance outside Himself, so that there were a time when He [the Son] did not exist. No, rejecting every suggestion of corporality, we hold that the Word and Wisdom was begotten out of the invisible and incorporeal God, without anything corporal being acted upon The expression which we employ, however,—that there was never a time when He did not exist,—is to be taken with a certain allowance.

For these very words *when* and *never* are terms of temporal significance, while whatever is said of the Father, Son, and the Holy Spirit, is to be understood as transcending all time, all ages, and all eternity. For it is the Trinity alone which exceeds every sense in which not only *temporal* but even *eternal* may be understood. It is all other things, indeed, which are outside the Trinity, which are to be measured by time and ages.

ca. 235 Novatian, antipope, *The Trinity*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ*—

31 God the Father, founder and creator of all things, who alone knows no beginning, who is invisible, immeasurable, immortal, and eternal, is one God. Neither His greatness nor His majesty nor His power can possibly be—I should not say exceeded, for they cannot even be equaled. From Him, when He willed it, the Word was born, His Son. ... And the latter, since He was born of the Father, is always in the Father. And I do indeed say *always*, not to prove Him unborn, but born. He that exists before all time must be said to have been in the Father always; for He that exists before all time cannot be spoken of in relation to time. And always must He be in the Father, otherwise the Father were not always the Father. And yet the Father even precedes Him, because it is necessary for the Father to be prior, in order to be the Father.

It is necessary for Him who knows no origin to be antecedent to Him who has an origin. ... He, then, when the Father willed it, proceeded from the Father. And He that was in the Father because He was from the Father, was afterwards with the Father because He proceeded from the Father—that divine substance, I mean, whose name is Word, and through whom all things were made, and without whom was made nothing. For all things are after Him, because they are made

through Him; and properly He is before all things but after the Father, since all things were made through Him, while He proceeded from Him of whose will all things were made: assuredly, He is God proceeding from God, causing, as Son, a second Person after the Father, but not taking away from the Father the fact that God is one.

252 Pope Saint Cornelius I, 21st Bishop of Rome, Letter to Cyprian of Carthage

—one God, not many—

49 [46]:2 [*Certain men, having fallen into a schism and now seeking reconciliation, besought Cornelius, saying:*] "... We are not ignorant of the fact that there is one God, and one Christ the Lord whom we confess, and one Holy Spirit; and that there must be one bishop in the Catholic Church.

ca. 255 Saint Cyprian, Bishop of Carthage, Letter to Jubaianus, A Bishop in Mauretania

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

73:12 [If a heretic] were made a temple of God—now I ask you: of what God? Of the Creator? But that is not possible, because he does not believe in Him. Of Christ? One who denies that Christ is God cannot become His temple. Of the Holy Spirit? Since the Three are One, how were it possible for the Holy Spirit to be reconciled to him that is an enemy of either the Son or of the Father?

262 Pope Saint Dionysius I, 25th Bishop of Rome, Letter to Dionysius of Alexandria

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

1 Next, then, I may properly turn to those who divide and cut apart and destroy the most sacred proclamation of the Church of God, making of it, as it were, three powers, distinct substances, and three godheads. I have heard that some of your catechists and teachers of the Divine Word take the lead in this tenet. They are, so to speak, diametrically opposed to the opinion of Sabellius. He, in his blasphemy, says that the Son is the Father and vice versa. ... [Some heretics] proclaim that there are in some way three gods, when they divide the Sacred Unity into three substances foreign to each other and completely separate. ...

2 Therefore, the Divine Trinity must be gathered up and brought together in One, a Summit, as it were—I mean the omnipotent God of the universe. ...

It is blasphemy, then, and not a common one but the worst, to say that the Lord is in any way a handiwork. ... But if the Son came into being, there was a time when these attributes did not exist; and, consequently, there was a time when God was without them—which is utterly absurd. ... 3 Neither, then, may we divide into three godheads the wonderful and divine Unity. ... Rather, we must believe in God, the Father almighty; and in Christ Jesus, his Son; and in the Holy Spirit; and that the Word is united to the God of the Universe. "For," says He, "the Father and I are one" (Jn 10:30); and "I am in the Father, and the Father in me" (Jn 14:10).

ca. 265 Saint Gregory Thaumaturgus, Bishop of Caesarea, student of Origen, The Creed

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

One God, the Father of the living Word, of subsistent Wisdom and Power, and of the Eternal image. Perfect Begetter of the Perfect, Father of the only-begotten Son. One Lord, comprehending the constitution of the universe, and Power shaping all creation. Genuine Son of genuine Father, Invisible of Invisible, and Incorruptible of Incorruptible, and Immortal of Immortal, and Eternal of Eternal.

And one Holy Spirit, having substance from God, and who is manifested—to men, that is—through the Son; Image of the Son, Perfect of the Perfect; Life, the Cause of living; Holy Fountain; Sanctity, the Dispenser of Sanctification; in whom is manifested God the Father who is above all and in all, and God the Son who is through all. Perfect Trinity, in glory and eternity and sovereignty neither divided nor estranged.

Wherefore there is nothing either created or subservient in the Trinity, nor anything caused to be brought about, as if formerly it did not exist and was afterwards introduced. Wherefore neither was the Son ever lacking to the Father, nor the Spirit to the Son; but without variation and without change, the same Trinity forever.

313 Edict of Milan, legalization of Christianity throughout the Roman Empire

325 Council of Nicaea, first ecumenical council, Creed

—divinity of Christ formally defined | one God, not many—

We believe in one God, the Father Almighty, Maker of all things visible and invisible. And in

one Lord Jesus Christ, the Son of God; the only-begotten of the Father, that is, of the substance with of the Father; God of God, Light of Light, true God of true God; begotten, not made; of the same substance of the Father; through whom all things were made, both those in heaven and those on earth; who for us men and for our salvation came down, took flesh, and was made man, suffered, and rose up on the third day, ascended into heaven, and will come to judge the living and the dead. And in the Holy Spirit. But those who say there was a time when He was not, and that He was made out of what did not exist, or who say that He is of another hypostasis or substance, or that the Son of God created or subject to change or alteration, the Catholic Church anathematizes.

ca. 358 Saint Hilary, Bishop of Poitiers, Doctor of the Church, *The Trinity*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—*

2:29 [Concerning the Holy Spirit] it is not necessary to speak of Him who must be acknowledged, who is from the Father and the Son, His sources. ...

12:56 In the fact that before times eternal Your Only-begotten was born of You, when we put an end to every ambiguity of words and difficulty of understanding, there remains only this: He was born. So too, even if I do not grasp it in my understanding, I hold fast in my consciousness to the fact that your Holy Spirit is from you through Him.

ca. 360 Saint Athanasius, Bishop of Alexandria, Doctor of the Church, *Discourses Against the Arians*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ—*

1:14 When these points have been demonstrated, then [the Arians] speak even more impudently: "If there never was a time when the Son was not, and if He is eternal and coexists with the Father, then you are saying that He is not a Son at all, but the Father's brother." O dull and contentious men! Indeed, if we said only that He coexisted eternally and had not called Him Son, their pretended difficulty would have some plausibility. But if while saying that He is eternal, we confess Him as Son of Father, how were it possible for Him that is begotten to be called a brother of Him that begets? ... For the Father and the Son were not generated from some preexisting source, so that they might be accounted as brothers.

Rather, the Father is the source and begetter of the Son. ... It is proper for men to beget in

time, because of the imperfections of their nature; but the offspring of God is eternal because God's nature is ever perfect.

374 Saint Epiphanius, Bishop of Salamis, *The Man Well-anchored*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—*

75 The Father always existed and the Son always existed, and the Spirit breathes from the Father and the Son; and neither is the Son created nor is the Spirit created. ...

120 We believe in one God, the Father almighty, maker of all things, both visible and invisible; and in one Lord Jesus Christ, the Son of God, begotten of God the Father, Only-begotten, that is, of the substance of the Father; God of God, Light of Light, true God of true God; begotten, not made; consubstantial with the Father; through whom all things were made, both those in heaven and those on earth, both visible and invisible; who for us men and for our salvation came down and took flesh, that is, was born perfectly of the holy ever-virgin Mary by the Holy Spirit, was made man, that is, He received perfect man, soul and body and mind and all that man is, except sin

381 Saint Ambrose, Bishop of Milan, Doctor of the Church, *The Holy Spirit*

—*divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—*

1:11:120 Lastly, Wisdom so says that she came forth from the mouth of the Most High (Eccl. 24:5), as not to be external to the Father, but with the Father; for "the Word was with God;" and not only with God but also in God; for He says: "I am in the Father and the Father is in Me" (Jn 14:11). But neither when He goes forth from the Father does He retire from a place, nor is He separated as a body from a body; nor when He is in the Father is He as if a body enclosed as it were in a body. The Holy Spirit also, when He proceeds from the Father and the Son, is not separated from the Father nor separated from the Son. For how could He be separated from the Father Who is the Spirit of His mouth? Which is certainly both a proof of His eternity, and expresses the Unity of this Godhead.

381 Council of Constantinople, second ecumenical council, *Creed*

—*divinity of the Holy Spirit formally defined | one God, not many | divinity of Christ—*

We believe in one God, the Father Almighty, Maker of heaven and of earth and of all things

visible and invisible. And in one Lord Jesus Christ, the Son of God, the Only-begotten, begotten of the Father before all the ages. Light of light; true God of true God; begotten, not made; of the same substance as the Father; through whom all things were made; who for us men and for our salvation came down from heaven and took flesh of the Holy Spirit and of Mary the Virgin and was made man. He was crucified for us in the time of Pontius Pilate and suffered and was buried; and rose up on the third day, according to the Scriptures, and ascended into heaven, and is seated at the right of the Father, and will come again in glory to judge the living and the dead; of whose kingdom there will be no end. And in the Holy Spirit, the Lord, the Giver of life, who is preceding from the Father, who together with the Father and the Son is adored and glorified, who spoke through the prophets. In one holy, catholic, and apostolic Church; we confess one Baptism for the remission of sins; and we await the resurrection of the dead and a life of the age to come. Amen.

382 *Pope Saint Damasus I, Synod of Rome, first declaration of the complete canon of the Bible*

382 Damasus I, 37th Bishop of Rome, Tome
—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

1 We anathematize those who do not freely proclaim that the Holy Spirit is of one power and substance with the Father and the Son.

2 We anathematize those also who follow the error of Sabellius in saying that the same one is both Father and Son. ...

17 If anyone does not say that the Holy Spirit can do all things, knows all, and is everywhere, just as the Son and the Father: he is a heretic.

18 If anyone says that the Holy Spirit is a creature, or that He was made by the Son: he is a heretic. ...

20 If anyone does not say of the Father, Son, and Holy Spirit, that there is one godhead, strength, majesty, and power, one glory and dominion, one reign, and one will and truth: he is a heretic.

21 If anyone does not say that there are three Persons of Father, and of Son, and of the Holy Spirit, equal, always living, embracing all things visible and invisible, ruling all, judging all, giving life to all, making all, and saving all: he is a heretic.

ca. 408 Saint Augustine, Bishop of Hippo, Doctor of the Church, *The Trinity*
—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—

5:14:15 If, therefore, that which is given has for its principle the one by whom it is given, because it did not receive from anywhere else that which proceeds from the giver, then it must be confessed that the Father and the Son are the Principle of the Holy Spirit, not two Principles, but just as the Father and the Son are one God and, relative to a creature, one Creator and one Lord, so too, relative to the Holy Spirit they are one Principle. ... Father and Son and Holy Spirit are one Principle, even as they are one Creator and one Lord. ...

15:17:29 And yet it is not without reason that in this Trinity only the Word of God is called Son, only the Gift of God the Holy Spirit, and only He of whom the Word is begotten and from whom principally the Holy Spirit proceeds is called God the Father. I have added the term "principally," because the Holy Spirit is found to proceed also from the Son.

416 Augustine, *Homilies on the Gospel of John*
—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—

99:8 From Him from whom the Son has it that He is God (for He is God of God),—from Him He certainly has it that the Holy Spirit also proceeds from Him; and therefore the Holy Spirit has it from the Father Himself that He proceeds also from the Son just as He proceeds from the Father.

ca. 424 Saint Cyril, Bishop of Alexandria, Doctor of the Church, *Treasury of the Holy and Consubstantial Trinity*

—one God, not many; divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit; filioque—

Thesis 34 Since the Holy Spirit when He is in us effects our being conformed to God, and He actually proceeds from the Father and Son, it is abundantly clear that He is of the divine essence, in it in essence and proceeding from it.

431 Council of Ephesus, third ecumenical council, *Epistle of Cyril to Nestorius*
—Christ, one divine Person with two natures (divine and human), formally defined | Marian title "Mother of God" sanctioned | one God, not many—

The holy and great Synod therefore says, that the only begotten Son, born according to nature of God the Father, very God of very God, Light of Light, by whom the Father made all things, came down, and was incarnate, and

was made man, suffered, and rose again the third day, and ascended into heaven. These words and these decrees we ought to follow, considering what is meant by the Word of God being incarnate and made man. For we do not say that the nature of the Word was changed and became flesh, or that it was converted into a whole man consisting of soul and body; but rather that the Word having personally united to himself flesh animated by a rational soul, did in an ineffable and inconceivable manner become man, and was called the Son of Man, not merely as willing or being pleased to be so called, neither on account of taking to himself a person, but because the two natures being brought together in a true union, there is of both one Christ and one Son; for the difference of the natures is not taken away by the union, but rather the divinity and the humanity make perfect for us the one Lord Jesus Christ by their ineffable and inexpressible union. ... This the declaration of the correct faith proclaims everywhere. This was the sentiment of the holy Fathers; therefore they ventured to call the holy Virgin, the Mother of God, not as if the nature of the Word or his divinity had its beginning from the holy Virgin, but because of her was born that holy body with a rational soul, to which the Word being personally united is said to be born according to the flesh.

447 *filioque used in the Creed of the Synod of Toledo*

451 Council of Chalcedon, fourth ecumenical council, *The Definition of Faith*

—distinctiveness of two natures in Christ (divine and human) formally defined—

Following the holy Fathers we teach with one voice that the Son [of God] and our Lord Jesus Christ is to be confessed as one and the same [Person], that he is perfect in Godhead and perfect in manhood, very God and very man, of a reasonable soul and [human] body consisting, consubstantial with the Father as touching his Godhead, and consubstantial with us as touching his manhood; made in all things like unto us, sin only excepted; begotten of his Father before the worlds according to his Godhead; but in these last days for us men and for our salvation born [into the world] of the Virgin Mary, the Mother of God according to his manhood. This one and the same Jesus Christ, the only-begotten Son [of God] must be confessed to be in two natures, unconfusedly, immutably, indivisibly, inseparably [united], and that without the distinction of natures being taken away by such union, but rather the

peculiar property of each nature being preserved and being united in one Person and subsistence, not separated or divided into two persons, but one and the same Son and only-begotten, God the Word, our Lord Jesus Christ, as the Prophets of old time have spoken concerning him, and as the Lord Jesus Christ hath taught us, and as the Creed of the Fathers hath delivered to us.

ca. 452 Saint Patrick, first Bishop of Ireland, *Confession*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

1 Because there is no other God nor ever was nor will be in future days, other than God who is unbegotten Father, without beginning, yet from whom is all beginning and who holds all things in being as we have come to learn; and his Son Jesus Christ whom together with his Father, we bear witness, has most surely always existed even before time began, begotten spiritually and present with the Father in a manner beyond any human words; before all time began. And through him have all things, seen and unseen, been made, then he himself was made man, and once death had been overcome, he was received into the heavens with his Father. "And he has given him full power over every name in the heavens, on earth and in the depths beneath so that every tongue shall confess him that Jesus Christ is our Lord and God" (Phil 2:9-11). It is he whom we believe and we hope he will soon come again, to be "judge of the living and dead who will render to each man according to his deeds" (Acts 10:42; Rom 2:6). And "he has poured out abundantly his Holy Spirit upon us" (Titus 3:5-6), given as his pledge of our immortality. Which Holy Spirit makes us both believers, obedient "children of God and equal heirs with Christ" (Rom 8:16-17): whom we confess and adore, one God in the most holy named Trinity.

ca. 460 Pope Saint Leo the Great, 45th Bishop of Rome, Doctor of the Church, *Sermon LXXVII, On Whitsuntide, III*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

For the Majesty of the Holy Ghost is never separate from the Omnipotence of the Father and the Son, and whatever the Divine government accomplishes in the ordering of all things, proceeds from the Providence of the whole Trinity. Therein exists unity of mercy and loving-kindness, unity of judgment and justice: nor is there any division in action

where there is no divergence of will. What, therefore, the Father enlightens, the Son enlightens, and the Holy Ghost enlightens: and while there is one Person of the Sent, another of the Sender, and another of the Promiser, both the Unity and the Trinity are at the same time revealed to us, so that the Essence which possesses equality and does not admit of solitariness is understood to belong to the same Substance but not the same Person.

ca. 500 *filioque used in the Athanasian Creed*

ca. 525 Saint Fulgence, Bishop of Ruspe, *The Rule of Faith*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—*

53 Hold most firmly and never doubt in the least that the only God the Son, who is one Person of the Trinity, is the Son of the only God the Father; but the Holy Spirit, Himself also one Person of the Trinity, is Spirit not of Father only, but of Father and of Son together. ...

54 Hold most firmly and never doubt in the least that the same Holy Spirit who is Spirit of the Father and of the Son, proceeds from the Father and the Son.

553 Second Council of Constantinople, fifth ecumenical council, *Capitula*

—*one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | the "Three Chapters" are condemned, the rulings of previous councils upheld—*

1 If anyone shall not confess that the nature or essence of the Father, of the Son, and of the Holy Ghost is one, as also the force and the power; [if anyone does not confess] a consubstantial Trinity, one Godhead to be worshipped in three subsistences or Persons: let him be anathema. For there is but one God even the Father of whom are all things, and one Lord Jesus Christ through whom are all things, and one Holy Spirit in whom are all things.

2 If anyone shall not confess that the Word of God has two nativities, the one from all eternity of the Father, without time and without body; the other in these last days, coming down from heaven and being made flesh of the holy and glorious Mary, Mother of God and always a virgin, and born of her: let him be anathema.

589 *filioque inserted into the Nicene-Constantinopolitan Creed at the Third Synod of Toledo*

636 *death of Saint Isidore of Seville, last of the Western Fathers*

680 Third Council of Constantinople, 6th ecumenical council, *The Definition of Faith—two wills in Christ (divine and human) formally defined | one God, not many—*

Following the five holy Ecumenical Councils and the holy and approved Fathers, with one voice defining that our Lord Jesus Christ must be confessed to be very God and very man, one of the holy and consubstantial and life-giving Trinity, perfect in Deity and perfect in humanity, very God and very man, of a reasonable soul and human body subsisting; consubstantial with the Father as touching his Godhead and consubstantial with us as touching his manhood; in all things like unto us, sin only excepted; begotten of his Father before all ages according to his Godhead, but in these last days for us men and for our salvation made man of the Holy Ghost and of the Virgin Mary, strictly and properly the Mother of God according to the flesh; one and the same Christ our Lord the only-begotten Son of two natures unconfusedly, unchangeably, inseparably indivisibly to be recognized, the peculiarities of neither nature being lost by the union but rather the proprieties of each nature being preserved, concurring in one Person and in one subsistence, not parted or divided into two persons but one and the same only-begotten Son of God, the Word, our Lord Jesus Christ, according as the Prophets of old have taught us and as our Lord Jesus Christ himself hath instructed us, and the Creed of the holy Fathers hath delivered to us; defining all this we likewise declare that in him are two natural wills and two natural operations indivisibly, inconvertibly, inseparably, unconfusedly, according to the teaching of the holy Fathers. And these two natural wills are not contrary the one to the other (God forbid!) as the impious heretics assert, but his human will follows and that not as resisting and reluctant, but rather as subject to his divine and omnipotent will. For it was right that the flesh should be moved but subject to the divine will, according to the most wise Athanasius. For as his flesh is called and is the flesh of God the Word, so also the natural will of his flesh is called and is the proper will of God the Word, as he himself says: "I came down from heaven, not that I might do mine own will but the will of the Father which sent me!" (Jn 6:38) where he calls his own will the will of his flesh, inasmuch as his flesh was also his own. For as

his most holy and immaculate animated flesh was not destroyed because it was deified but continued in its own state and nature (ὁρθῶς τε καὶ λόγῳ), so also his human will, although deified, was not suppressed, but was rather preserved according to the saying of Gregory Theologus: “His will [i.e., the Saviour’s] is not contrary to God but altogether deified.”

743 Saint John Damascene, Doctor of the Church, *An Exact Exposition of the Orthodox Faith*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

I:8 (We believe) in one Father, the beginning, and cause of all: begotten of no one: without cause or generation, alone subsisting: creator of all: but Father of one only by nature, His Only-begotten Son and our Lord and God and Saviour Jesus Christ, and Producer of the most Holy Spirit. And in one Son of God, the Only-begotten, our Lord, Jesus Christ: begotten of the Father, before all the ages: Light of Light, true God of true God: begotten, not made, consubstantial with the Father, through Whom all things are made: and when we say He was before all the ages we shew that His birth is without time or beginning: for the Son of God was not brought into being out of nothing, He that is the effulgence of the glory, the impress of the Father’s subsistence, the living wisdom and power, the Word possessing interior subsistence, the essential and perfect and living image of the unseen God. But always He was with the Father and in Him, everlastingly and without beginning begotten of Him. For there never was a time when the Father was and the Son was not, but always the Father and always the Son, Who was begotten of Him, existed together. ...

Likewise we believe also in one Holy Spirit, the Lord and Giver of Life: Who proceedeth from the Father and resteth in the Son: the object of equal adoration and glorification with the Father and Son, since He is co-essential and co-eternal: the Spirit of God, direct, authoritative, the fountain of wisdom, and life, and holiness: God existing and addressed along with Father and Son: uncreated, full, creative, all-ruling, all-effecting, all-powerful, of infinite power, Lord of all creation ...

And again we speak of the three subsistences as being in each other, that we may not introduce a crowd and multitude of Gods. Owing to the three subsistences, there is no compoundness or confusion: while, owing to their having the

same essence and dwelling in one another, and being the same in will, and energy, and power, and authority, and movement, so to speak, we recognise the indivisibility and the unity of God. For verily there is one God, and His Word and Spirit.

ca. 749 *death of Saint John Damascene, last of the Eastern Fathers*

869-870 Fourth Council of Constantinople, eighth ecumenical council, *Canons*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

Introduction Consequently, all of us bishops who have come to take part in the synod and to strengthen the truth and undefiled faith of Christians and the teaching of orthodox religion, we declare our belief in one God, in three persons consubstantial, divine and autonomous, as, for example, we may look at the one nature of light in three suns not unlike each other or in the same number of dazzling objects. We confess, indeed, God to be one, unique in respect of substance, but threefold or three if we are speaking of him in respect of persons, and we declare he has not received from himself that he has been made, nor in any way whatsoever from anyone else; but that he alone, ever existing without beginning, and eternal, ever the same and like to himself, and suffering no change or alteration, that he exists as the maker and source of all beings endowed with intelligence and feeling. For the holy and great synod of Nicaea spoke thus when expounding the creed: Light from light, true God, clearly declaring the Son to be from the Father who is true God, and the rest as the catholic church received it. We too, accepting this in the identical meaning, anathematize as of unsound mind and an enemy of the truth, *Arius* and all who, with him and following him, speculate with faulty perceptions on the term “hetero-substantial”, that is otherness of substance and unlikeness, with reference to the divinely-ruling and blessed Trinity. But no less do we accept the second, holy and universal synod [Constantinople I], and we anathematize that adversary of the Spirit or rather adversary of God, *Macedonius*; for we admit in the distinction of persons no difference of substance between the Father, the Son and the divine and autonomous Spirit, as the aforementioned heresiarchs did, nor do we confuse, like the lunatic *Sabellius*, the persons in one and the same substance.

968 Liutprand, Bishop of Cremona, *Report of His Mission to Constantinople*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

[The Holy] Spirit by which all things are vivified and ruled; ... fills the universe; ... knows the Word; ... is co-eternal, and of one substance with God the Father and His Son Jesus Christ, without beginning, without end, for ever true.

1014 *filioque inserted into the Roman creed*

1054 *Eastern Schism*

1094 Saint Anselm, Bishop of Canterbury, Doctor of the Church, *On the Incarnation of the Word*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

Therefore, since God is eternity, there is not a plurality of gods; for God is not outside God, and God within God does not add numerically to God. Therefore, there is always only one and the same God. And so when God is born of God, given that what is born is not outside that from which it is born, the offspring is in the parent and the parent is in the offspring: that is, the Father and the Son are one God. And when God proceeds from God the Father and God the Son, he does not depart and go outside God; God—that is, God the Holy Spirit—remains in the God from whom he proceeds, and the Father and the Son and Holy Spirit are one God. And since this birth and this procession have no beginning—for otherwise the eternity born and the eternity proceeding would have a beginning, which is false—we neither should nor can in any way think that God began to be Father or Son or Holy Spirit.

1152 Saint Hildegard of Bingen, Doctor of the Church, *Scivias*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

III:Vision 7 Thus the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit testify that they are in no way disunited in power, even though they are distinguished in Persons, because they work together in the unity of the simple and immutable substance. How? The Father creates all things through the Word, Who is His Son in the Holy Spirit; and the Holy Spirit is He by Whom all things flourish in the Father and the Son. And so these three Persons are in the unity of inseparable substance; but They are not indistinct among themselves. How? He Who begets is the Father; He Who is born is the Son; and He Who in eager freshness proceeds from the Father and the Son, and sanctified the

waters by moving over their face in the likeness of an innocent bird, and streamed with ardent heat over the apostles, is the Holy Spirit.

For the Father had the Son before time began, and the Son was with the Father, and the Holy Spirit was co-eternal with the Father and the Son in the Unity of Divinity.

1215 Fourth Lateran Council, 12th ecumenical council, *Canons*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

1 We firmly believe and openly confess that there is only one true God, eternal, beyond measure and unchangeable, incomprehensible, omnipotent and ineffable, the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit: Three persons but a single essence, substance, or nature that is wholly one; the Father proceeding from Son, the Son proceeding from the Father alone, and the Holy Spirit [proceeding] from both in like manner; without beginning and having no end for ever: the Father begetting, the Son being begotten, and the Holy Spirit proceeding; having the same substance, the same equality, the same omnipotence, and the same eternity; the one principle of the universe.

ca. 1378 Saint Catherine of Siena, Doctor of the Church, *Dialogue*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

13 [*The soul*.] “You said, ‘Let us make humankind in our image and likeness’ (Gn 1:26). And this you did, eternal Trinity, willing that we should share all that you are, high eternal Trinity! You, eternal Father, gave us memory to hold your gifts and share your power. You gave us understanding so that, seeing your goodness, we might share the wisdom of your only-begotten Son. And you gave us free will to love what our understanding sees and knows of your truth, and so share the mercy of your Holy Spirit.” ...

110 [*God the Father*.] “[T]he Holy Spirit proceeds from me the Father and from him the Son, and we are one and the same.”

1439 Council of Ferrara-Florence, 17th ecumenical council, *Decree Translating the Council of Ferrara to Florence*

—one God, not many / divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

For when Latins and Greeks came together in this holy synod, they all strove that, among other things, the article about the procession of

the holy Spirit should be discussed with the utmost care and assiduous investigation.

Texts were produced from divine scriptures and many authorities of eastern and western holy doctors, some saying the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son, others saying the procession is from the Father through the Son. All were aiming at the same meaning in different words. The Greeks asserted that when they claim that the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father, they do not intend to exclude the Son; but because it seemed to them that the Latins assert that the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son as from two principles and two spirations, they refrained from saying that the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son. The Latins asserted that they say the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father and the Son not with the intention of excluding the Father from being the source and principle of all deity, that is of the Son and of the holy Spirit, nor to imply that the Son does not receive from the Father, because the holy Spirit proceeds from the Son, nor that they posit two principles or two spirations; but they assert that there is only one principle and a single spiration of the holy Spirit, as they have asserted hitherto. Since, then, one and the same meaning resulted from all this, they unanimously agreed and consented to the following holy and God-pleasing union, in the same sense and with one mind.

In the name of the holy Trinity, Father, Son and holy Spirit, we define, with the approval of this holy universal council of Florence, that the following truth of faith shall be believed and accepted by all Christians and thus shall all profess it: that the holy Spirit is eternally from the Father and the Son, and has his essence and his subsistent being from the Father together with the Son, and proceeds from both eternally as from one principle and a single spiration. We declare that when holy doctors and fathers say that the holy Spirit proceeds from the Father through the Son, this bears the sense that thereby also the Son should be signified, according to the Greeks indeed as cause, and according to the Latins as principle of the subsistence of the holy Spirit, just like the Father.

And since the Father gave to his only-begotten Son in begetting him everything the Father has, except to be the Father, so the Son has eternally from the Father, by whom he was

eternally begotten, this also, namely that the holy Spirit proceeds from the Son.

We define also that the explanation of those words “and from the Son” was licitly and reasonably added to the creed for the sake of declaring the truth and from imminent need.

1517 *Martin Luther posts Ninety-five Theses at Wittenberg*

1538 *King Henry VIII breaks England away from the Church*

1545-1563 *Council of Trent formally defines various doctrines rejected by Luther*

1546 Council of Trent, 19th ecumenical council, third session, *Decree Touching on the Symbol of Faith*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—

In the Name of the Holy and Undivided Trinity, Father, and Son, and Holy Ghost. ...

I believe in one God, the Father Almighty, maker of heaven and earth, of all things visible and invisible; and in one Lord Jesus Christ, the only-begotten Son of God, and born of the Father before all ages; God of God, light of light, true God of true God; begotten, not made, consubstantial with the Father, by whom all things were made: who for us men, and for our salvation, came down from the heavens, and was incarnate by the Holy Ghost of the Virgin Mary, and was made man: crucified also for us under Pontius Pilate, he suffered and was buried; and he rose again on the third day, according to the Scriptures; and he ascended into heaven, sitteth at the right hand of the Father; and again he will come with glory to judge the living and the dead; of whose kingdom there shall be no end: and in the Holy Ghost the Lord, and the giver of life, who proceedeth from the Father and the Son; who with the Father and the Son together is adored and glorified; who spoke by the prophets and one holy Catholic and Apostolic Church. I confess one baptism for the remission of sins; and I look for the resurrection of the dead, and the life of the world to come. Amen.

1660 Saint Maria de Agreda, *The City of God: The Coronation*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit | filioque—

1:5 This petition of our Redeemer in heaven [to send the divine Paraclete to the Apostles] was supported on earth by most holy Mary in a manner befitting the merciful Mother of the

faithful. Prostrate upon the earth in the form of a cross and in the profoundest humility, She saw, how in that consistory of the blessed Trinity, the request of the Savior was favorably accepted, and how, to fulfill and execute it, the persons of the Father and the Son, as the Principle from which the Holy Ghost proceeded, decreed the active mission of the Holy Spirit; for to these Two is attributed the sending of the third Person, because He proceeds from Both; and the third Person passively took upon Himself this mission and consented to come into the world.

1750 Saint Alphonsus Maria de Liguori, Bishop of Saint Agatha, Doctor of the Church, *The Glories of Mary*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

2:1 Now, let us see how befitting it was that God, and all the three divine Persons, should thus preserve [Mary] from [original sin]; that the Father should preserve her as his daughter, the Son as his Mother, and the Holy Ghost as his Spouse.

1897 Pope Leo XIII, 257th Bishop of Rome, *Divinum Illud Munus*

—divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit / filioque—

1 “It is expedient to you that I go: for if I go not, the Paraclete will not come to you: but if I go, I will send Him to you” (Jn 16:7). In these words [Jesus] gave as the chief reason of His departure and His return to the Father, the advantage which would most certainly accrue to His followers from the coming of the Holy Ghost, and, at the same time, He made it clear that the Holy Ghost is equally sent by—and therefore proceeds from—Himself and the Father; that He would complete, in His office of Intercessor, Consoler, and Teacher, the work which Christ Himself had begun in His mortal life. For, in the redemption of the world, the completion of the work was by Divine Providence reserved to the manifold power of that Spirit, who, in the creation “adorned the heavens” (Job 26:13), and “filled the whole world” (Wis 1:7).

1962-1965 Second Vatican Council defines the nature of the Church

1964 Vatican II, 21st ecumenical council, *Lumen Gentium*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

4 When the work which the Father gave the Son to do on earth was accomplished, the Holy Spirit was sent on the day of Pentecost in order

that He might continually sanctify the Church, and thus, all those who believe would have access through Christ in one Spirit to the Father (cf. Eph 2:18). He is the Spirit of Life, a fountain of water springing up to life eternal (cf. Jn 4:14; 7:38-39). To men, dead in sin, the Father gives life through Him, until, in Christ, He brings to life their mortal bodies (cf. Rom 8:10-11). The Spirit dwells in the Church and in the hearts of the faithful, as in a temple (cf. 1 Cor 3:16; 6:19). ... By the power of the Gospel He makes the Church keep the freshness of youth. Uninterruptedly He renews it and leads it to perfect union with its Spouse. The Spirit and the Bride both say to Jesus, the Lord, “Come!” (Rv 22:17).

Thus, the Church has been seen as “a people made one with the unity of the Father, the Son and the Holy Spirit” (Cyprian, *The Lord’s Prayer* 23).

2003 Joseph Cardinal Ratzinger (Pope Benedict XVI), *God Is Near Us*

—one God, not many | divinity of Christ and the Holy Spirit—

[The Nicene Creed] makes specific mention of the Holy Spirit and the Virgin Mary. But then there is also the “he”, of “he was born”. This “he” has previously been given various names: Christ, “the only Son of God, ... true God from true God ... , of one Being with the Father”. So within this “he”—and indivisible from him—there is contained another Self: the Father, with whom he is of one Being, so that he can be said to be God from God. That means: the first and true agent in this sentence, the subject, is—as we could hardly imagine to be otherwise, in view of what we have just recalled—God, but God in three Persons, who yet are but one: the Father, the Son, and the Holy Spirit.